| From: | Sabina Taj |
| :--- | :--- |
| To: | Chao Wu |
| Cc: | Michael Martirano; BoE Email; |
| Subject: | Re: "those people" and HCPSS redistricting |
| Date: | Saturday, September 7, 2019 10:52:06 AM |

Dear Chao,
I look forward clearing up these misconceptions.
Warmly,
Sabina

Sent from my iPhone
On Sep 6, 2019, at 11:36 PM, Chao Wu < Chao_Wu@hcpss.org $>$ wrote:

Sabina,

When you and Dr. Martirano talked about "those people" with a disdaining tone on their registration to testify while waiting in a long line, you probably did not notice everybody else stopped talking.

I am looking forward to talking to you on this soon.

Best regards,

Chao

## Dr. Chao Wu <br> Board Member <br> Howard County Board of Education

Email: chao_wu@hcpss.org

From: Sabina Taj [Sabina_Taj@hcpss.org](mailto:Sabina_Taj@hcpss.org)
Sent: Friday, September 6, 2019 1:01:37 PM
To: Michael Martirano [Michael_Martirano@hcpss.org](mailto:Michael_Martirano@hcpss.org)
Cc: Chao Wu [Chao_Wu@hcpss.org](mailto:Chao_Wu@hcpss.org); BoE Email [boe@hcpss.org](mailto:boe@hcpss.org); Kathleen V. Hanks [Kathleen_Hanks@hcpss.org](mailto:Kathleen_Hanks@hcpss.org)
Subject: Re: "those people" and HCPSS redistricting

Dear Chao, board members, and Mike,
I too am confused and dismayed by your email, Chao, interpreting our dinner conversation. It does not accurately reflect the conversation. If you are feeling this way, however, we should definitely discuss this matter in person to clarify
misunderstandings so that there are no hurt feelings.
It's important to remember that passions are running high and also that we all have unique perspectives and lived experiences that shape our views. Ultimately we are trying to arrive at a solution that is best for our students and the community as a whole. We will get there by working collectively and collaboratively as a board and a system.

I hope you all have a restful weekend. Please don't hesitate to reach out anytime if you'd like to talk by phone or in person.

Warmly, Sabina

Sent from my iPhone
On Sep 6, 2019, at 10:24 AM, Michael Martirano
[Michael_Martirano@hcpss.org](mailto:Michael_Martirano@hcpss.org) wrote:

Dr. Wu and Board Members,
I have just read your email and to say that I am taken back and confused is an understatement. I would greatly appreciate the opportunity to discuss this with you and anyone else, in person, to seek clarification as to what precipitated this email. Thank you.

MJM

Dr. Michael J. Martirano
Superintendent
Howard County Public School System
"Be kind ALWAYS! Everyone is fighting a hard battle."

On Sep 5, 2019, at 9:35 PM, Chao Wu < Chao_Wu@hcpss.org> wrote:

Dear Dr. Martirano and Sabina,

During the recess dinner time tonight, you two happily talked about "those people" who registered to testify on
the redistricting proposal. I feel the tone is demeaning. Those parents are also parents of our students who will be impacted. In addition, some of those parents may be my friends from River Hill or Atholton or other places.

By the way, Dr. Martirano, you only reply happily and cc to the board to those who support your redistricting proposal. That seems there is bias. It is fine to have a plan who is not perfect.

I did not want say this publicly in front of our senior staff team.

Best regards,

Chao

| From: | Chao Wu |
| :--- | :--- |
| To: | Michael Martirano |
| Cc: | Sabina Taj; BoE Email; Kathleen V. Hanks |
| Subject: | RE: "those people" and HCPSS redistricting |
| Date: | Friday, September 6, 2019 11:30:26 PM |

Dr. Martirano,

I am looking forward to talking to you about this. Do you have any time after 3:00 next Wednesday afternoon?

Thanks.

Chao

Dr. Chao Wu<br>Board Member<br>Howard County Board of Education<br>Email: chao_wu@hcpss.org

From: Michael Martirano [Michael_Martirano@hcpss.org](mailto:Michael_Martirano@hcpss.org)
Sent: Friday, September 6, 2019 10:24:23 AM
To: Chao Wu [Chao_Wu@hcpss.org](mailto:Chao_Wu@hcpss.org)
Cc: Sabina Taj [Sabina_Taj@hcpss.org](mailto:Sabina_Taj@hcpss.org); BoE Email [boe@hcpss.org](mailto:boe@hcpss.org); Kathleen V. Hanks
[Kathleen_Hanks@hcpss.org](mailto:Kathleen_Hanks@hcpss.org)
Subject: Re: "those people" and HCPSS redistricting
Dr. Wu and Board Members,
I have just read your email and to say that I am taken back and confused is an understatement.
I would greatly appreciate the opportunity to discuss this with you and anyone else, in person, to seek clarification as to what precipitated this email. Thank you.

## MJM

Dr. Michael J. Martirano
Superintendent
Howard County Public School System
"Be kind ALWAYS! Everyone is fighting a hard battle."

On Sep 5, 2019, at 9:35 PM, Chao Wu < Chao_Wu@hcpss.org> wrote:

During the recess dinner time tonight, you two happily talked about "those people" who registered to testify on the redistricting proposal. I feel the tone is demeaning. Those parents are also parents of our students who will be impacted. In addition, some of those parents may be my friends from River Hill or Atholton or other places.

By the way, Dr. Martirano, you only reply happily and cc to the board to those who support your redistricting proposal. That seems there is bias. It is fine to have a plan who is not perfect.

I did not want say this publicly in front of our senior staff team.

Best regards,

Chao

| From: | Melissa Rodriguez |
| :---: | :---: |
| To: | Superintendent; DJung@howardcountymd.gov; dyungmann@howardcountygov.org; Mavis Ellis; kirstencombs@hcpss.org; Vicky Cutroneo; jennifer mello@hcpss.org; sabrina taj@hcpss.org; Chao Wu |
| Subject: | [External] Polygon \#1186 |
| Date: | Friday, September 6, 2019 3:50:56 PM |

Dear Superintendent, Members of the Board and County Council,
I am writing in opposition of the redistricting of the polygon where I live in Columbia, River Hill neighborhood. Although my children have already graduated from the high school, and benefited from a wonderful education at our howard county schools, I disagree with the redistricting proposal that moves the middle school children in my neighborhood. The milage to the current middle school is 2.4 miles from my home, and the proposed school will double this to over 5 miles. It will also break up our river Hill neighborhood. Please leave our polygon where it is for the future and current students. Thank you for listening to our concerns,
Melissa Rodriguez


| From: | kiju |
| :---: | :---: |
| To: | Councilmail@howardcountymd.gov; Superintendent; CalvinBall@howardcountymd.gov; BoE Email |
| Cc: | contact@maryland.gov; howardcountydems@gmail.com; HoCoRepublicanClub@gmail.com; Shawna Frazier; |
|  | Maria J. Gutierrez; yingi zhang; guorong01@yahoo.com |
| Subject: | [External] Re: Resolution CR112-2019 has fatal flaws |
| Date: | Friday, September 6, 2019 12:13:20 PM |
| Attachments: | Council_letter_JK.doc |
|  | 08202019 Attendance Area Adjustment BR.pdf |
|  | CR112-2019.pdf |

Dear all,
I believe the proposed resolution is biased against Asian Americans and multi-ethnic Clarksville. Better resolutions and redistricting plans to achieve socio-economic integration and upward mobility in Howard County are needed and suggestions are made. Please see attached.

Kind regards,
Julie Kim, M.D.

Julie Kim, M.D.


September 6, 2019
To Whom It May Concern,
I commend Councilmembers Rigby, Jones and Jung for starting the public conversation, as follows:
This socioeconomic and racial segregation in the school system is contributing to increasing achievement gaps and decreasing graduation rates for low-income students and students of color. Historic systems have created these achievements gaps [SIC] and it is incumbent on the County to introduce new systems that foster necessary change. ${ }^{1}$

It is important to acknowledge that de facto segregation is a stubborn stain that persists in our country due to the legacy of slavery since 1619. Thanks to the efforts of courageous Americans before us, we no longer have de jure segregation since 1954. What we should also acknowledge is increased immigration from Asia, Africa and the Middle East since the Immigration and Nationality Act of 1965. ${ }^{2}$ As a result, in 2019, the superintendent's report indicates (pages 26-27/34) Clarksville Elementary, Clarksville Middle and River Hill High include over 50\% students of color (e.g., Asian American, African American, Latino, etc.), while boasting some of the highest test scores in the county, and maybe even state.

I would like to point out that Resolution CR112-2019 inadvertently leaves out Asian Americans. At last count, Howard County was comprised of $19 \%$ Asian Americans. ${ }^{3}$ With all due respect, it appears that segregation is being defined too narrowly. There seems to be a flawed working assumption that Asian Americans do not count as students of color or experience setbacks due to exclusion and underestimation. Might I remind all, that the term "Asian" refers to the planet's largest and most populous continent. Most of the world lives there and it includes an amazing diversity of ethnicities, religions, and cultures. Indeed, you are hard-pressed to find any self-identifying "Asians" in Asia. My neighbors who check the Asian box are Russian, Turkish, Iranian, Indian, Chinese, Vietnamese and Korean immigrants. It is only when these immigrants come to the United States, that they are arbitrarily lumped together in political calculations. I am also aware that Clarksville Elementary serves a disproportionate population for whom English is a second language and disabled students. Clarksville is

[^0]not homogenously comprised of middle-class white students, as cited in the Century Foundation reference provided in the resolution (page 3/4). Our schools are already diverse in many ways.

Yet, the superintendent's proposed redistricting plan unfairly targets our schools with overcrowding, disruption, and anguish; it divides Clarksville in half. Unfortunately, many students of color (i.e., Asian Americans, African Americans, Latinos) and Whites in Clarksville would be penalized with relocation to less desirable schools to remedy a wrong they did not commit. Our children are not test taking zombies who serve as tools to raise school averages. My neighbors include a child of Shanghainese origin who spends hours shaping his favorite cartoons out of clay, an African-American classmate who dazzled with his violin at the spring concert, a child of Colombian (the country) immigrants who invited us to his birthday party at Columbia (the city) gym, a child of Iranian immigrants who invited us to his Tae Kwon Do dojo, and a Jewish classmate who likes to practice diving at the neighborhood pool. My likes to dance the "floss" and "Gangnam style" when no one's looking.

As a clinical trial reviewer, I understand that these flesh-and-blood details often get lost in aggregate data found in tables and charts. In the zeal to right historic wrongs and diversify socioeconomically, I would like to remind the Council not to treat our children like soulless numbers who can be reformatted just to make statistics look good in a Power Point.

I would like to ask the county and the Council to consider alternative solutions for socio-economic integration that are less disruptive and may be more effective than radical redistricting:

- How about more evenly distributing FARM students across the county? Some western county schools that are less ethnically diverse are receiving significantly less students than Clarksville.
- Where is the intensive remediation urgently needed for students failing PARCC reading and math tests? Summer, and even Saturday, school would seem to more directly address low test scores and graduation rates.
- Can there be an effort to prepare and send top-scoring FARM students to higher scoring schools for more efficient skills transfer, integration and upward mobility? Similar success has already been demonstrated with private schools and colleges. ${ }^{4}$
- On my wish list, as a prospective homebuyer, is to designate a county-wide centrally located magnet high school which feeds from the top $10 \%$ of each middle school and historically marginalized population (i.e., FARM) so that an excellent and diverse school option is uncoupled from neighborhood school districts with regard to housing price.

As you may already be aware, Howard County leads the state of Maryland in public school quality. ${ }^{5}$ Currently, it is uniquely poised to lead our nation in achieving intelligent integration, equal opportunity

[^1]and academic excellence, which I believe are values consistent with Columbia's founders and unite us. Whether you are for or against the resolution, let's not squander this historic opportunity and expand the pie for all, including Asian Americans. Our community can do better than fight over scraps, be divided, and repeat mistakes of the past.

Thank you for your time and attention.

All the best to you,
Julie

| From: | Vicky Cutroneo |
| :--- | :--- |
| To: | Chao Wu; Michael Martirano; Sabina Taj |
| Cc: | BoE Email; Kathleen V. Hanks |
| Subject: | Re: "those people" and HCPSS redistricting |
| Date: | Friday, September 6, 2019 6:03:10 AM |

Pretty disheartened after dinner recess.
Get Outlook for iOS
From: Chao Wu [Chao_Wu@hcpss.org](mailto:Chao_Wu@hcpss.org)
Sent: Thursday, September 5, 2019 9:34:58 PM
To: Michael Martirano [Michael_Martirano@hcpss.org](mailto:Michael_Martirano@hcpss.org); Sabina Taj [Sabina_Taj@hcpss.org](mailto:Sabina_Taj@hcpss.org)
Cc: BoE Email [boe@hcpss.org](mailto:boe@hcpss.org); Kathleen V. Hanks [Kathleen_Hanks@hcpss.org](mailto:Kathleen_Hanks@hcpss.org)
Subject: "those people" and HCPSS redistricting

Dear Dr. Martirano and Sabina,

During the recess dinner time tonight, you two happily talked about "those people" who registered to testify on the redistricting proposal. I feel the tone is demeaning. Those parents are also parents of our students who will be impacted. In addition, some of those parents may be my friends from River Hill or Atholton or other places.

By the way, Dr. Martirano, you only reply happily and cc to the board to those who support your redistricting proposal. That seems there is bias. It is fine to have a plan who is not perfect.

I did not want say this publicly in front of our senior staff team.

Best regards,

Chao

| From: | Kathleen V. Hanks |
| :---: | :---: |
| To: | Anissa Dennis; Anne Roy; Brian Ralph; Brian W. Bassett; Bruce Gist; cac.hocoboe@gmail.com; Carol D. Feeser; |
|  | Caroline Walker; Carrie A. Slaysman; Cathleen Mascaro; Daniel Lubeley; David K. Larner; David L. Clark; David |
|  | W. Ramsay; Deborah J. Summers; Douglas Pindell Jr; Ebony Langford-Brown; Emily Bahhar; Evelyn B. Wohlers; |
|  | Gina Petrick; Ginny Patzer; Jahantab Siddiqui; James R. LeMon; Jeannie G. Veale; Jennifer Bubenko; Jennifer D. |
|  | Sifuentes; Jennifer Mallo; Jessica Goldstein; Joan R. Fox; Juliann M. Dibble; Justin Benedict; Karalee Turner- |
|  | Little; Karen G. Heinly; Kathleen Bainbridge; Kathy Agans; Kathy Benton; Kevin Gilbert; Kim Masters; Kimberly |
|  | Clare; Lisa Beschner; Lisa Sota; Lu M. Roberts; Marilyn Grosskopf; Mark Blom; Mary J. Crotts; Mary V. Drew; |
|  |  |
|  | Dickson; Nicole Carter; Patrick J. Saunderson; Pierre Van Greunen; Renato Toledo Jr; Renee Kamen; Restia |
|  | Whitaker; Robin Heaphy; Robin M. Beck; Ron K. Morris; Rosalie A. Edwards; Scott Washington; Sheila Fike; Staci |
|  | A. Cousin; Susan G. Williams; Tanya Lomax; Terrell Savage; Terri Enke; Terry Eberhardt; Theo Cramer; Thomas |
|  | McNeal; Trudy M. Grantham; Valerie C. Gist; Valerie J. Willis; Vivian L. Kelly; Wendy P. Ryan; William J. Barnes |
| Subject: | Board of Education July-Sept Approved Quarterly Agenda Rev. \#8 |
| Date: | Thursday, September 5, 2019 7:59:16 PM |
| Attachments: | Quar Aa July Sept 2019 Approved Rev 8.pdf |

Good Evening,

# Attached is revision \#8 of the Board's July through September Approved Quarterly Agenda. Please contact me if you have any changes. Thank you for your assistance. 

## Kind regards,

Kathy Hanks
Administrator
Board of Education of Howard County
Phone: 410-313-7194
Fax: 410-313-6833

| From: | Danielle Lueking |
| :--- | :--- |
| To: | BoE Email; Student Board Member |
| Cc: | Kathleen V. Hanks; Michael Martirano; Karalee Turner-Little; Mark Blom |
| Subject: | FW: New MPIA request 2020-060 submitted |
| Date: | Thursday, September 5, 2019 1:10:34 PM |

Good afternoon,
Please be advised we have received the Maryland Public Information Act request below for Board emails with various search terms. I have clarified with this requester that they are only seeking those emails to and from (direct communication) Board members and council members (not including staff). I will conduct a search of all @hcpss.org mailboxes with the keywords provided based on the date. Emails to/from personal accounts would also be responsive if conducted in connection with the transaction of HCPSS business on this topic (per our definition of a record under policy 3050). If you have such records please reach out by the end of this week to determine the volume of records and how we can obtain copies.

Upon receipt of all responsive records, we will review for content which may be exempt under an MPIA provision. We will follow-up to advise members and staff of final content to be released.

Please feel free to reach out to Mark or myself with questions regarding the MPIA.
-----Original Message-----
From: mpia_requests@hcpss.org [mpia_requests@hcpss.org](mailto:mpia_requests@hcpss.org)
Sent: Tuesday, September 3, 2019 3:27 PM
To: HCPSS MPIA Requests [MPIA_Requests@hcpss.org](mailto:MPIA_Requests@hcpss.org)
Subject: New MPIA request 2020-060 submitted
A new Public Information Act request has been submitted.
Tracking Number: 2020-060
Created: 2019-09-03
Name: Shane Liu
Email: Sliu2100@gmail.com
Phone Number:
Street Address 1:
Street Address 2:
City:
State: MD
Zip Code:
URL: http://mpia.hcpss.org/node/750
Request:
Could you help provide all county counsel and BoE email communications from May 1, 2019 till today containing any of the the following key words: Redistricting, Desegregation, Equity, Legal, RHHS, Asian, conflict of interest. Thanks!

| From: | Carl Latkin <br> To: |
| :--- | :--- |
| Subject: $\underline{\text { Superintendent; Chao Wu; Mavis Ellis }}$ <br> Date: [External] Redistricting <br>  Wednesday, September 4, 2019 8:57:12 PM |  |

As a parent of students who have been in Harpers Choice and River Hill, where we currently reside, I strongly support redistricting. Students should be in school with equitable distribution of families with resources as well as the distribution of school resources. Our children have learned so much from others with diverse backgrounds. It is critical that our schools have economic diversity. In regards to the issue of busing, and hence potentially student leaving earlier in the morning for school, I strongly support staring the high schools later in the day, which has been demonstrated in many excellent studies to reduce substance abuse, accidents, and deleterious mental health conditions.
This proposed redistricting may reduce my property value, but this is a small price to pay to ensure an equitable education for all of our children in Howard County.
Best regards,
Dr. Carl Latkin


[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ https://cc.howardcountymd.gov/Portals/0/Documents/CouncilMain/Press\%20Releases/2019/CMR_OJ_DJ\%20Des egregation\%20Press\%20Release.pdf
    ${ }^{2}$ https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Immigration_and Nationality Act of 1965
    ${ }^{3}$ https://www.baltimoresun.com/maryland/howard/howard-magazine/bs-mg-ho-diversity-data-20190109story.html

[^1]:    ${ }^{4}$ https://www.prepforprep.org/
    ${ }^{5}$ https://www.niche.com/k12/d/howard-county-public-schools-md/

