

Timestamp	Committee Member's Vote	Reason for vote	Other Comments
October 2021		Red Scarf Girl - Re-evaluation of Instructional Materials	
10/19/2021 16:37:02	Retain	I think you cannot deny or avoid history, and the story is realistic, so the schools should keep it. Also, it is non-fiction, so the themes and morals are more significant than those books are are fictional.	
10/19/2021 16:41:09	Retain	It's an effective text to expose students to important historical events and and how these events apply to our world today.	
10/19/2021 16:44:23	Retain	The story is appropriate for grade 6 students. The memoir provides historical content and awareness into a significant moment in history. Students have an opportunity to read and discuss the story in depth with the guidance of their teacher. I recommend this title be kept in the school curriculum.	
10/19/2021 16:51:48	Retain	This is an important book. It is historical and appropriate for the middle school level. It has many universal themes such as power and friendship and the importance of family and traditions. My daughter read this in 6th grade and my niece read it in elementary school. I read it then but I re-read it in order to review it for this meeting. At the review meeting, parents from China whose grandparents actually lived through the Cultural War also said this is a good book. It has a female Chinese American author and is told through the eyes of a Chinese female main character. The author also came to my daughter's school. It is important for kids to have role models like this. There are some dark themes but kids this age also read books about Sudan, the Holocaust, slavery, and racism. They are at the age where they are learning more about the world.	Thank you for allowing us the opportunity to review school materials.
10/19/2021 16:52:59	Retain	The book is properly telling a story happened in certain special history background of China from a teenager girl's experience. This is a good book for middle schooler to undersand the culture revolution. The author has a very good skill to merge the chaos in a little girl's life and reproduced the history easily and simply. There is darkness and violence mentioned in the book but not too much, not too deep. I think It is appropriate for middle schooler.	
10/19/2021 16:55:05	Remove	Unless teachers understand the background/history of cultural revolution and guide students well, it may be very hard for the middle schoolers to digest, except that they read it as a story only. This book maybe more appropriate for high schoolers.	
10/21/2021 7:40:54	Retain	Red Scarf Girl is an important piece of literature in middle school ELA. I, and several others I've spoken with, remember this book long after, and still remember it as an impactful piece and one of the favorite ELA choices. As I read through it again, I'm so glad my 6th grade self got to see it. Not only does it provide a different perspective on the Chinese Revolution - the one willing to serve Mao, which is often villainized in western media - it also provides Chinese representation in schools. In a pool of mostly western literature, this piece of Asian work is refreshing. [REDACTED], I loved seeing piece of my culture being part of something. And this book is especially a good representation of the culture, one containing serious issues that many other books aren't able to tackle correctly. The challenged issues of suicide and public humiliation add to the power of the story. When I was a 6th grader, I was shocked and horrified, but it /wasn't/ drastically offensive or disruptive to anyone. It made our class feel more heavy and serious - sympathy and anger even, toward the government - and helped us understand the Cultural Revolution and its struggle so much better. The removal of this book from the system threatens Chinese representation in schools, which is already very little, and takes away a piece of authentic and useful literature.	

Timestamp	Committee Member's Vote	Reason for vote	Other Comments
10/23/2021 13:11:02	Retain	<p>Red Scarf Girl is one of the sole representations of Chinese culture in the middle school reading curriculum, and it offers a perspective of the Cultural Revolution not often portrayed by western media and is necessary for students to learn sooner or later. I myself read the book in class in 6th grade, and, [REDACTED], I remember feeling extremely happy to be seen in school literature; such opportunities are far in between. Several students have commented on the dire need of more non-western studies in our school system, and taking away this book would further that issue. Although being challenged, the mentioned suicide and public humiliation are both parts of the powerful impact the book brings, deepening the message and reader understanding. It's effectually irreplaceable, as anything that brings such a message of loss and family will rarely be clear of trauma. Additionally, people I have talked to - peers who read the book in 6th grade as well - distinctly remember the book and spoke highly of it, especially among other English material; the mentions of the worse actions did not seem to affect them negatively. Sheltering elementary students is plausible, but middle schools can and need to handle more serious and cruel events, as they start to gain free thought.</p>	
10/4/2021 14:40:56	Retain	<p>I have taught it in class. The students see injustice and courage in other cultures. Plus, the author comes into the school and presents her story.</p>	